

EVALUATION GUIDE FOR JUDGES

CRITERIA	*Superior (91-93) Recommended for Highest Award (94-100)	Excellent (81-90)	Above Average (71-80)	Average (70 or lower)
I. LITERARY				
A. Content/Quality Originality, variety, strength of ideas and themes. Effective language, clarity, precision, expressiveness, sophistication, rhythm, musicality. Masterful use of literary devices (i.e., metaphor, image, symbol). Exploration of genres (drama, wit, fantasy, thought) and literary forms (varieties of verse, prose narrative, dialogue, essay) to express themes.	Outstanding writing. Writing by students dominates. (50-45 points)	High-quality writing. Writing by students dominates. (44-41 points)	Sound writing. Writing by students dominates. (40-35 points)	Some good writing, but quality inconsistent. (35-0 points)
B. Rhetorical Variety Poetry; narrative fiction; dramatic dialogue; personal essay; non-fiction writing-from-across-the-curriculum; translations; multi-media presentations (e.g., music and film).	Many genres (at least 5) represented. Writing from many subject areas. Writing by students dominates. (15-14 points)	Variety of genres (at least 4) represented. Some writing from other subject areas. Writing by students dominates. (13-12 points)	At least 3 genres. One or two pieces from other subject areas. Student participation weak. (11 points)	Predominance of 1 or 2 genres. Nothing beyond poetry and short stories. Other subject areas not represented. Student participation weak. (10-0 points)
C. Editing, Proofreading	Meticulous editing. Error-free. Students dominate these processes. (15-14 points)	Strong editing. Minimal errors. Students have strong role in these processes. (13-12 points)	Good editing, but noticeable errors. Student participation weak. (11 points)	Frequent errors distract from writing. No evidence of student participation. (10-0 points)

CRITERIA	*Superior (91-93) Recommended for Highest Award (94-100)	Excellent (81-90)	Above Average (71-80)	Average (70 or lower)
II. DESIGN AND GRAPHICS				
A. Artistic Quality Overall artistic quality. Effective use of art and design to complement writing. Effective layout and typography.	Unifying design, high-quality graphics, coherence of theme and design. Students dominate. (15-14 points)	Attractive design and graphics. Art and design connect to writing. Students have a strong role. (13-12 points)	Layout adequate, but design elements and graphics of inconsistent quality with little or no connection to writing. Student participation weak. (11 points)	Simplistic or haphazard layout. No attempt to connect writing to graphics. No evidence of student participation. (10-0 points)
B. Front Matter and Pagination Legible and informative front matter (i.e., Table of Contents). Title page (title, school, city, district, state, date). Staff credits; contact information.	Complete, accurate, and well-designed. Students dominate all aspects. (5 points)	Complete, accurate, clear. Students have a strong role. (4 points)	Complete, but design is cluttered or confusing. Student participation weak. (3 points)	Incomplete. No evidence of student participation. (2-0 points)

***Note:** This special award recognizes magazines that fulfill extraordinary standards of excellence. In such magazines, students handle virtually all aspects of writing, production, and business with exceptional skill. The magazine is characterized by a variety of genres including print and multi-media presentations; highly original and technically outstanding writing; high quality design with fonts and graphics that complement the theme and tone; inclusion of high-quality writings from various disciplines; and other evidence that school wide participation has gone into the development of the magazine. The PRESLM advisory committee selects this award at the NCTE Annual Convention. The Highest Award may be given to several magazines in a particular year, or it may be given to none.